



TECHNIUM
SOCIAL SCIENCES JOURNAL



Vol. 53/2024
A New Decade for Social Changes

PLUS
COMMUNICATION P



International
Communication & PR

Implementation of Civil Servant Discipline Policy in The Office of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Of Minahasa Regency

Daine Lantang¹, Evi Elvira Masengi², Selpius Kandou³

Public Administration Magister Program, Faculty of Social Sciences and Law,
Universitas Negeri Manado

daine_candra@yahoo.co.id¹, evielviramasengi@gmail.com²,
selpiusrkandou08@gmail.com³

Abstract. Discipline for employees who work for the Government, namely Civil Servants, absolutely requires regulations regarding discipline which serve as guidelines for disciplining employees. Disciplinary Regulations to create order in the work environment to encourage employees to compete in improving performance to be more productive in order to realize the implementation of government and development tasks. The aim of this research is to find out, analyze and describe the implementation of Civil Servant Discipline Policy in the Minahasa Regency Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Service based on PP Number 94 of 2021 concerning Civil Servant Discipline. This research uses a descriptive qualitative method with data collection techniques, namely observation, interviews and documentation, with data analysis techniques and drawing conclusions. The research results show that the work discipline of civil servants in the Minahasa Regency Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Service is not yet optimal because there are still employees who violate the rules in accordance with the applicable regulations regarding the limits on starting and leaving office hours. There are employees who still do not understand the Job Desk in accordance with the Main Duties and Functions, procrastinate on the work they are given, and there is a lack of sanctions given by their superiors. Factors that hinder civil servant discipline are leadership factors and factors from the employees themselves in the form of employee quality and mentality and lack of socialization of the implementation of these government regulations.

Keywords. Implementation, Policy, Discipline, Civil Servants

A. Introduction

The progress of a country depends on development programs in various fields that must continue to be carried out, this can run well if it is supported by quality employees. Employees are the main element of human resources who play a role in the success of government administration and development. This means that civil servants are the foundation in the implementation of government in accordance with their respective duties and functions (Masengi et al., 2023) [1].

Civil servants are entrusted by the state to bring this nation to success and achieve national development goals. Civil servants are required to carry out their duties to serve the

people and run the government. Civil servants must maintain their image and prioritize the interests of society. Civil servants are obliged to sacrifice their personal or group interests for the interests of the state and society (Sendouw et al., 2023) [2].

According to Government Regulation Number 94 of 2021 concerning Civil Servant Discipline, which is the legal basis for regulating the proper and correct preparation of state apparatus. Article 1 explains that Civil Servant Discipline is the ability of civil servants to comply with obligations and avoid prohibitions specified in statutory regulations. Based on Government Regulation Number 94 of 2021 in the second part of Article 3 letter f concerning showing integrity and exemplary behavior in attitudes, behavior, speech and actions towards everyone, both inside and outside the service and article 4 letter f concerning the obligation to come to work and obey provisions on working hours, with the imposition of sanctions by authorized officials if the legal norms governing these provisions are clear, complete, practical and also easy to implement [3].

The aim of Government Regulation Number 94 of 2021 is to create a mindset of civil servants who are aware of the rules, regulations and discipline of civil servants, and most importantly to make civil servants more obedient so that the creation of state civil servants as public servants in accordance with the principles good government. In carrying out daily government duties, civil servants are expected to have high discipline and be responsible and have a good work ethic (Dewi, 2022) [4].

Civil Servants are a profession that works in government agencies. Civil servants are the main human resources in the government apparatus who have a very important and strategic role in carrying out tasks or work related to government. In carrying out these duties, a civil servant must of course have work discipline and a code of ethics in carrying out his work (Masengi et al., 2023) [5].

Based on the description above, discipline for employees who work for the government, namely Civil Servants, absolutely requires regulations regarding discipline which serve as guidelines for disciplining employees. Disciplinary regulations are intended to create order in the work environment which is expected to encourage employees to compete in improving performance to be more productive in order to realize the implementation of government and development tasks.

Inhibiting factors that influence civil servant discipline, in this case, are sometimes civil servants who are not disciplined. The work discipline factor is an effort by the agency to apply all regulations and rules to all State Civil Apparatus. Work discipline can take the form of implementing attendance, rules, regulations and discipline in the use of work equipment. If these three elements of discipline can be implemented well and ASNs carry out all the elements of discipline without being forced to do so, good working environment conditions will be created. The absence of good discipline will hinder the implementation of services. Likewise, in terms of discipline in completing each area of work, sometimes they are still not disciplined. Because it is caused by the personal busyness of each Civil Servant during working hours and there is no longer a civil servant code of ethics that is understood in carrying out their duties. Such problems should first be avoided when they are within the scope of work or official engagements which are their duties and responsibilities and uphold the Code of Ethics for Civil Servants which has been stated in the oath of promise, so that the services provided will be carried out well and respected.

The smooth implementation of government and national development depends on the perfection of the State apparatus (Paisa et al., 2019) [6]. Civil servants must be able to improve the mental attitude of work discipline and have the motivation to improve and uphold civil

servant ethics. Civil servants who have high discipline, have attitudes and behavior that are obedient to the State, have good ethics, and are aware of their responsibilities as public servants can encourage the success of government administration and development. Discipline can guarantee that employees carry out their main duties and functions as state officials. Work discipline must always be improved by each agency because employees who have a high level of discipline and have a good code of ethics will be able to provide benefits to each agency, but on the other hand, if the level of discipline is low and does not have a code of ethics, the employee will tend to do things that are This is not a good thing and is very detrimental to the agency. With discipline, government administration can run well which ultimately can realize the goals of government.

The role and position of Civil Servants is important and determining, because civil servants are one element of the state apparatus that carries out government and national development in order to achieve state goals. Civil servants are an asset in carrying out government and development tasks in every field, the existence of civil servants is able to oversee the nation's journey (Komara, 2019) [7].

As elements of the State apparatus and civil servants, Civil Servants have morals and character that are beyond reproach, capable of carrying out their duties professionally and responsibly in carrying out government and development tasks, and are free from corruption, collusion and nepotism. Every Civil Servant is obliged to be devoted to God Almighty, is obliged to provide services fairly and evenly to the community based on loyalty and obedience to Pancasila, the 1945 Constitution, the State and the Government. To ensure that every Civil Servant always strives to increase their loyalty, obedience and service, statutory provisions are stipulated that regulate the attitudes, behavior and actions of Civil Servants, both inside and outside the service. Work ethic in the civil servant code of ethics: Honest, responsible and with high integrity; Careful and disciplined; Serve with respect, courtesy and without pressure; Carry out their duties in accordance with the provisions of laws and regulations; ethics in the state include implementing Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution, raising the honor and dignity of the nation, being the glue of the Republic of Indonesia, obeying laws and regulations in carrying out duties, being accountable, clean and dignified, responsive, honest, open and accurate, efficient and effective with state resources, and do not provide false or untrue testimony. Then ethics in society, namely realizing a simple lifestyle, providing services with empathy, respect and politeness without strings attached or coercion, providing services quickly, precisely, openly and fairly, non-discriminatory, responsive to the community environment, and oriented towards the welfare of society in carrying out duties. Meanwhile ethics in self-discipline include providing honest and open information, being sincere and serious in acting, avoiding conflicts of personal, group or group interests, always improving science and technology, skills, abilities and attitudes, having high fighting power, maintaining physical and spiritual health, maintaining family integrity and harmony, and having a simple, neat and polite appearance.

Furthermore, the ethics of fellow civil servants are mutual respect for religious adherents, maintaining the unity and cohesion of civil servants, respecting differences of opinion, upholding the dignity of civil servants, maintaining cooperative cooperation among civil servants, assembling in the Republic of Indonesia Civil Service Corps (KORPRI) guaranteeing sociality and solidarity among civil servants. And Organizational ethics include carrying out duties and authority in accordance with applicable regulations, maintaining confidential information, implementing policies determined by authorized officials, building on work for organizational performance, having competence in carrying out tasks, thinking creatively and motivatingly, and improving the quality of work .Said Yulianto, an officer who

has the spirit of a civil servant corps, always has a sense of oneness and integrity, togetherness, cooperation, responsibility, dedication, discipline, creativity and a sense of belonging to a civil servant organization (Santoso & Dewi, 2019) [8].

Based on initial observations, problems were also found related to discipline, especially Article 3 letter (f) and Article 4 letter (f). The problem encountered in this article was the problem of employees understanding the civil servant code of ethics but not implementing it properly, resulting in disagreements because feel right and difficult to appreciate someone according to their respective responsibilities, apart from that civil servants who have many responsible duties but there is no news and are difficult to contact. Employee problems are related to discipline, namely not complying with existing working hours provisions, such as arriving late, not attending morning roll call, leaving early and playing truant which affects employee performance, so that services that should be carried out tend to be slow and delayed. In addition, civil servants are often absent during working hours for no apparent reason. These violations occur repeatedly so that this indiscipline of course greatly affects the quality of service and hampers service. Looking at the existing problems, in this research the title was drawn as Implementation of the ASN Discipline Policy in the Minahasa Regency Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Service. The purpose of this research is to find out, analyze and describe the implementation of Civil Servant Discipline Policy in the Minahasa Regency Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Service based on PP Number 94 of 2021 concerning Civil Servant Discipline.

B. Method

This research uses a type of qualitative research which tends to focus on the process of searching for the meaning behind the phenomena that appear in the research, with the aim of making the problems to be studied more comprehensive, in-depth and natural (Sugiyono in Dilapanga et al., 2023) [9]. Thus, it is hoped that this qualitative approach can produce systematic, factual and accurate data so that it can dig deeper into the Implementation of Civil Servant Discipline Policy in the Minahasa Regency Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Service.

This research focuses on work discipline based on punctuality and factors that hinder employee discipline. The data analysis technique used is the Miles & Huberman approach model in Supit & Lumingkewas (2023), namely data collection, data reduction, data display, and drawing conclusions [10]. Then, to ensure the validity of the data, researchers used 4 main criteria presented by Lincoln and Guba in Moleong (2013), namely credibility, dependability, transferability, and confirmability [11].

C. Result and discussion

Work Discipline based on punctuality of Civil Servants

As elements of the State apparatus and civil servants, Civil Servants have morals and character that are beyond reproach, capable of carrying out their duties professionally and responsibly in carrying out government and development tasks, and are free from corruption, collusion and nepotism. Every Civil Servant is obliged to be devoted to God Almighty, is obliged to provide services fairly and evenly to the community based on loyalty and obedience to Pancasila, the 1945 Constitution, the State and the Government. To ensure that every Civil Servant always strives to increase their loyalty, obedience and service, statutory provisions are stipulated that regulate the attitudes, behavior and actions of Civil Servants, both inside and outside the service. Work ethic in the civil servant code of ethics: Honest, responsible and with

high integrity; Careful and disciplined; Serve with respect, courtesy and without pressure; Carry out their duties in accordance with the provisions of laws and regulations; ethics in the state include implementing Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution, raising the honor and dignity of the nation, being the glue of the Republic of Indonesia, obeying laws and regulations in carrying out duties, being accountable, clean and dignified, responsive, honest, open and accurate, efficient and effective with state resources, and do not provide false or untrue testimony. Then ethics in society, namely realizing a simple lifestyle, providing services with empathy, respect and politeness without strings attached or coercion, providing services quickly, precisely, openly and fairly, non-discriminatory, responsive to the community environment, and oriented towards the welfare of society in carrying out duties. Meanwhile ethics in self-discipline include providing honest and open information, being sincere and serious in acting, avoiding conflicts of personal, group or group interests, always improving science and technology, skills, abilities and attitudes, having high fighting power, maintaining physical and spiritual health, maintaining family integrity and harmony, as well as having a simple, neat and polite appearance. Next, the ethics of fellow civil servants are mutual respect for religious adherents, maintaining the unity and integrity of civil servants, respecting differences of opinion, upholding the dignity of civil servants, maintaining cooperative cooperation among civil servants, gathering in KORPRI guarantees sociality and solidarity among civil servants. And organizational ethics include carrying out duties and authority in accordance with applicable regulations, maintaining confidential information, implementing policies determined by authorized officials, building on work for organizational performance, have competence in carrying out tasks, think creatively and motivationally, and improve the quality of work.

Based on initial observations, problems were also found related to discipline, especially Article 3 letter (f) and Article 4 letter (f). The problem encountered in this article was the problem of employees understanding the civil servant code of ethics but not implementing it properly, resulting in disagreements because feel right and difficult to appreciate someone according to their respective responsibilities, apart from that civil servants who have many responsible duties but there is no news and are difficult to contact. Employee problems are related to discipline, namely not complying with existing working hours provisions, such as arriving late, not attending morning roll call, leaving early and playing truant which affects employee performance, so that services that should be carried out tend to be slow and delayed. In addition, civil servants are often absent during working hours for no apparent reason. These violations occur repeatedly so that this indiscipline of course greatly affects the quality of service and hampers service. Looking at the existing problems, in this research the title was drawn as Implementation of Civil Servant Discipline Policy in the Minahasa Regency Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Service.

Based on interviews conducted by researchers in research related to the Implementation of the ASN Discipline Policy in the Minahasa Regency Women's Empowerment and Child Protection Service, based on the Work Discipline indicator based on discipline when coming to work, it can be concluded that the time discipline of P3A service employees is not optimal, this is because there is already an SOP which regulates the limits regarding the start of entry and leaving hours from the office as stated in the Circular Letter of the Regent of Minahasa Number: 800/BKPSDM/II/163 concerning the Use of Electronic-based Presence Applications within the Minahasa Regency Government, which regulates on Monday - Thursday the hours for attendance attendance in the morning from 07:00 to 08.00 and afternoon attendance from 16.00 to 18.00, while on Friday the only difference is that afternoon attendance is held at 13.30. As well as a lack of understanding and application of the code of

ethics to improve civil servant discipline. There are some employees who do not understand the job description given, even when given tasks, some employees complain and delay work, there is a lack of sanctions given to employees so that they neglect some of the tasks given.

Meanwhile, in carrying out tasks based on observations and facts in the field, there are still some employees who arrive late, because each employee is busy, even regarding the timeliness of employees in carrying out tasks is not optimal, because one of the things that causes employees to not be able to complete the work punctuality or mental factors of employees who often procrastinate work. Or in other words, employees are more concerned with personal matters, this can be seen from their presence in the office and at certain hours employees are not in the work room or are outside dealing with personal matters. This condition causes work completion to be delayed. In this case, a control mechanism must be implemented in order to make the work more effective.

The Civil Servant Code of Ethics is not yet effective, because the implementation related to the Code of Ethics has not been properly mastered and understood by several employees in the P3A service. Based on the results of interviews, there are still several employees who do not understand the job description given, even when they are given assignments, some employees complain and delaying work, lack of sanctions given to employees so that they neglect some of the tasks given.

Policy implementation is the stage of the policy process immediately after the enactment of the law. As stated by Ripley and Franklin in Winarno (2002), policy implementation is what happens after laws are enacted that provide authority for programs, policies, benefits or types of tangible output [12].

Van Meter and van Horn in Nugroho (2011) understand policy implementation as actions carried out by individuals or government and private groups that are directed to achieve the goals set in previous policy decisions. These actions include efforts to convert decisions into operational actions within a certain period of time as well as in the context of continuing efforts to achieve large and small changes determined by policy decisions [13].

Understanding state administration ethics, according to Widodo (2001) in Aksa (2010), has a double meaning, namely: "State administration ethics is a field of science that discusses the ethical (moral) principles that underlie the behavior of government bureaucratic officials, especially in carrying out their duties. and its authority. Besides that, there is an understanding of state administration ethics as a set of values that serve as a reference or guide for human actions in organizations." [14]. Kartasasmita (1997: 24-25) in Tantri & Putri (2022), explains that: "State administration ethics as a relationship between the world of philosophy, values and morals with the world of administration as the world of decisions and actions, namely how to link the two, how to think about administration such as order, efficiency, usefulness, productivity can explain ethics in practice and how the basic ideas of ethics create good and avoid bad can explain the nature of administration" [15]. The understanding of state administration ethics was further explained by Kumorotomo (2002) who stated that: "State administration ethics is related to the broad scope of state administration and the dilemmas faced by administrators in managing public organizations. State administration ethics places moral rules in dealing with various dilemmas and problems concerning the personal position of an administrator in the process of interaction with the state and society" [16].

Factors that Inhibit Work Discipline

Based on interviews conducted by researchers regarding the implementation of the ASN Discipline Policy at the Minahasa Regency Women's Empowerment and Child Protection

Service, based on indicators of factors that hinder employee discipline, it can be concluded that the factors that hinder work discipline and influence the work discipline of civil servants are caused by two factors, namely leadership factors and employee factors. Factors that influence the work discipline of Civil Servants which originate from leadership factors are the lack of attention from leaders towards employees, the leader's attitude in providing motivation to employees in carrying out work, namely by providing rewards or welfare, the leadership's actions in making absolute decisions, and Cultural factors or work culture, if you are used to a good work environment, a good and disciplined mentality will be formed. Meanwhile, those originating from employee factors are the habit of carrying out disciplinary actions, employee motivation in completing work, namely by obtaining prosperity, employee mentality.

There are several experts who define Public Policy as actions taken by the government in response to a crisis or public problem. Likewise, Chandler and Plano, as quoted by Tangkilisan (2005), stated that public policy is the strategic use of existing resources to solve public problems, which is a form of intervention carried out continuously by the government for the benefit of disadvantaged groups in society. communities so that they can live, and participate in development at large [17].

Pressman and Wildavsky in Lumingkewas & Supit (2023) understand policy implementation as the activity of carrying out policies (to carry out), fulfilling promises as stated in policy documents (to fulfill), to produce output as stated in policy objectives (to produce), and to complete the mission that must be realized as contained in the policy objectives (to complete) [18].

Grindle in Masengi et al. (2023) explains that the task of implementation is to form a link that makes it easier for policy objectives to be realized as a result of a government activity. This means that implementation activities related to policies taken by the government must clarify and make it easier to achieve the goals that have been set. If not, it means there is an error in the policy analysis [19].

Abdul Wahab in Tahir (2011) said that policy implementation is: Implementation of basic policy decisions, usually in the form of laws, but can also take the form of orders or important executive decisions or decisions of judicial bodies usually, these decisions identify problems that be resolved, stating clearly the goals/targets to be achieved, and various ways to structure/manage the implementation process" [20].

Subarsono (2005) said that policies that have been recommended to be chosen by policy makers are not a guarantee that the policy will be successful in its implementation. Policy implementation involves the efforts of policy makers who influence the implementation of the policy. The policies taken are not necessarily successful because there are so many factors that influence the success of implementing the policy itself, both individual and group or institutional [21].

Langkai (2020) discusses the concept of policy implementation from Mazmanian and Sabatier that understanding policy implementation means trying to understand what happens after a program is implemented or formulated." From the definition above, it can be explained that the implementation of public policy is an effort to understand every process that occurs before and after the policy is implemented [22].

D. Conclusion

Based on the results of research conducted with a focus on civil servant discipline issues based on punctuality (time discipline) and factors that hinder work discipline, it can be concluded that overall employee discipline has not been effective, due to the following:

1) Civil Servant Work Discipline

a. Work Discipline based on punctuality

P3A service employees are not yet optimal, this is because there is already an SOP, in this case the Minahasa Regent's Circular Letter which regulates the limits for starting morning attendance hours and afternoon attendance hours, but there are still some employees who arrive late, due to the busyness of each employee, even regarding accuracy. Employee time in carrying out tasks is not optimal, because employees cannot complete work on time or procrastinate. With targets and deadlines, employees don't need to waste a lot of time doing work.

b. Code of Ethics

Implementation related to the Code of Ethics has not been properly mastered and understood by several employees at the P3A service based on the results of interviews that there are still several employees who do not understand the job description given, even when given assignments, some employees complain and delay work, there is a lack of sanctions given for employees so that they neglect some of the tasks given, because employees only carry out their duties in accordance with established procedures.

2) Factors that Inhibit Employee Discipline

The factors that influence the work discipline of Civil Servants are caused by two factors, namely leadership factors and employee factors. Factors that influence the work discipline of Civil Servants which originate from leadership factors are the lack of attention from leaders towards employees, the leader's attitude in motivating employees in carrying out their work, namely with rewards or welfare, the leadership's actions in making absolute decisions, and other factors. Culture or work culture, if you are used to a good work environment, a good and disciplined mentality will be formed. Meanwhile, what comes from employee factors is the habit of carrying out disciplinary actions, and employee motivation in completing work, namely by obtaining prosperity.

References

- [1] E. E. Masengi, E. M. C. Lumingkewas, and B. F. Supit, "Implementation of Government Regulation No. 53 of 2010 concerning Civil Servant Discipline in the Finance, Asset, and Revenue Management Office of Minahasa Regency," *Tech. Soc. Sci. J.*, vol. 40, pp. 11–22, 2023, doi: <https://doi.org/10.47577/tssj.v40i1.8404>.
- [2] R. H. E. Sendouw, E. M. C. Lumingkewas, B. F. Supit, and P. M. M. Kapojos, "Analysis of Performance Appraisal of State Civil Apparatus in the Regional Office of Education of North Sulawesi Province," *Tech. Soc. Sci. J.*, vol. 49, pp. 90–96, 2023.
- [3] P. N. R. Indonesia, "Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 94 Tahun 2021 tentang Disiplin Pegawai Negeri Sipil." Pemerintah Negara Republik Indonesia, Jakarta, 2021.
- [4] S. S. Dewi, "Pengaturan Disiplin PNS dalam Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 94 Tahun 2021 Tentang Disiplin PNS," *WICARANA*, vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 105–118, 2022.
- [5] E. E. Masengi, E. M. C. Lumingkewas, and B. F. Supit, *Reformasi Administrasi Publik*. Purbalingga: Eureka Media Aksara, 2023.
- [6] L. Paisa, R. Gosal, and D. Monintja, "Etika pemerinthan dalam meningkatkan kinerja aparatur sipil negara," *J. Eksek.*, vol. 3, no. 3, 2019.
- [7] E. Komara, "Kompetensi profesional pegawai asn (aparatur sipil negara) di indonesia," *Mimb. Pendidik.*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 73–84, 2019.
- [8] T. Santoso and M. P. Dewi, "Etika Aparatur Sipil Negara dalam Membangun Good Governance," *Transparansi J. Ilm. Ilmu Adm.*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 179–187, 2019.
- [9] A. R. Dilapanga, T. Pangalila, and B. F. Supit, "Analysis Of Village Direct Cash

- Assistance Policy Implementation In East Bolaang District Bolaang Mongondow Regency,” *Tech. Soc. Sci. J.*, vol. 39, pp. 89–97, 2023, doi: <https://doi.org/10.47577/tssj.v39i1.8260>.
- [10] B. F. Supit and E. Lumingkewas, “Implementasi Kebijakan Bantuan Sosial Tunai Di Kelurahan Talikuran Utara Kecamatan Kawangkoan Utara Minahasa,” *Acad. Educ. J.*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 1059–1068, 2023, doi: <https://doi.org/10.47200/aoej.v14i2.1981>.
- [11] L. J. Moleong, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*, Revisi. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2013.
- [12] B. Winarno, *Teori dan proses kebijakan publik*. Yogyakarta: Media Pressindo, 2002.
- [13] R. Nugroho, *Kebijakan publik*. Jakarta, 2011.
- [14] A. H. Aksa, “Etika Administrasi Publik; Peranannya Dalam Mewujudkan Good Governance,” *J. Ilm. Adm. Publik dan Pembang.*, vol. 1, no. 2, 2010.
- [15] R. A. Tantri and M. Putri, “Implementasi Etika Administrasi Publik dalam Pelaksanaan Pelayanan Vaksinasi Covid-19 di Kota Probolinggo,” *J. Sos. Polit. Integr.*, vol. 2, no. 5, pp. 289–297, 2022.
- [16] W. Kumorotomo, *Etika administrasi negara*. PT. Raja Grafindo Persada, 2002.
- [17] H. N. S. Tangkilisan, *Manajemen Publik*. Jakarta: Grasindo, 2005.
- [18] E. Lumingkewas and B. F. Supit, “Implementasi Kebijakan Pengelolaan Barang Milik Daerah Pada Pemerintah Kabupaten Minahasa,” *Acad. Educ. J.*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 1106–1116, 2023, doi: <https://doi.org/10.47200/aoej.v14i2.1982>.
- [19] E. E. Masengi, E. Lumingkewas, and B. F. Supit, “Implementasi Kebijakan Sertifikasi Guru Dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Guru Di SMA Negeri 2 Tondano,” *Acad. Educ. J.*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 1084–1095, 2023, [Online]. Available: <https://www.atlantispress.com/proceedings/unicssh-22/125984016>
- [20] A. Tahir, *Kebijakan Publik dan Transparansi Penyelenggaraan Pemerintah Daerah. Bandung*. Bandung: Penerbit Alfabeta University Press, 2011.
- [21] A. G. Subarsono, “Pelayanan Publik yang Efisien, Responsif, dan Non-Partisan,” *Mewujudkan Good Gov. Melalui Pelayanan Publik*, 2005.
- [22] J. E. Langkai, *Kebijakan Publik*. Malang: Seribu Bintang, 2020.