

Implementation of Teacher Certification Policy in SMA Negeri 1 Tondano of Minahasa Regency

Syiulce Hanna Tumundo 1, Jetty E. H. Mokat 2, Goinpeace H. Tumbel 3

Negeri Manado Public Administration Magister Program, Faculty of Social Sciences and Law, Universitas

syiulcehanna30@gmail.com¹, jettymokat@unima.ac.id²,
goinpeacetumbel@unima.ac.id³

Abstract. This research aims to find out, describe and analyze why certified teachers do not have the competencies expected to improve the academic abilities of students. This study uses a qualitative method. Based on the results of data analysis, a number of findings were obtained as follows: (1) Pedagogical competence of teachers who have understood the basic rules regarding professional education have not fully utilized the capacity development forums that have been provided. To understand students, teachers still have a tendency to focus on certain students, for example students who excel and students who have problems. Meanwhile, students who have moderate or intermediate abilities are often ignored. To create an attractive teaching and learning process, certified senior teachers need to improve their ability to use technological tools and mastery of ICT in accordance with existing technological developments and advances, and the availability of technology-based facilities or infrastructure needs to be improved. (2) Personality Competence: There are some professionally certified teachers at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano who have not been able to be role models for their students because of the lack of discipline on the part of the teachers, which ultimately makes the teachers lose their authority. Teacher indiscipline also ultimately means teachers are unable to evaluate their self-performance objectively. (3) Social Competence teachers who should be role models in interacting and communicating have not been able to implement good communication practices, even though they establish good relationships between all elements of the school. Communication that is not polite indicates that the teacher does not have the ability and skills to interact and communicate. Nevertheless, a positive educational environment has been created in SMA Negeri 1 Tondano because all elements behave well, avoid problems, respect and appreciate each other, and help each other. (4) Professional Competence has not been reflected in the teachers of SMA Negeri 1 Tondano, because the teachers still lack discipline, both in terms of working hours and dress discipline. Monitoring of the learning process has been carried out by the school and related agencies, but violations are still found by teachers. The implementation of coaching sanctions and reducing teaching hours apparently did not deter teachers.

Keywords. Implementation, Policy, Teacher Certification, Indonesian Education

A. Introduction

Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System in Chapter I Article I paragraph 1 states that: Education is a conscious and planned effort to create a

learning atmosphere and learning process so that students actively develop their potential to have religious spiritual strength, self-control, personality, intelligence, noble morals, and skills needed by himself, society, nation and state (Noor, 2018) [1]. This suggests that education in Indonesia is closely related to the personal qualities of teachers and their performance in educating students. People's expectations for quality education are of course influenced by many factors. However, what is more important, according to the Regent of Minahasa (2021) is how to produce quality teachers. In a more precise sentence, we would rather light a candle than curse the darkness; stop cursing darkness, let's light more and more candles. If we can produce quality teachers, this is the path to the emergence of a quality future generation (Munif Chatib, 2009) [2].

In Masengi et al. (2023) [3] explained that one of the efforts to improve teacher quality carried out by the Indonesian government was to issue a policy regarding Teacher and Lecturer Certification. This is regulated by Law Number 14 of 2005 concerning Teachers and Lecturers in December 2005. The position of teachers as professionals at the levels of primary education, secondary education and early childhood education at the formal education pathway in accordance with statutory regulations functions to improve The dignity and role of teachers as agents of learning and functioning to improve the quality of national education is stated in article 2:1 and article 4 of Law No. 14 2005 concerning Teachers and Lecturers. Teachers are required to have academic qualifications, competencies, educational certificates, be physically and spiritually healthy, and have the ability to realize national education goals. Article 10: 1 of Law No. 14 of 2005 concerning teachers and lecturers mandates that teachers must have competencies which include pedagogical competencies, personality competencies, social competencies and professional competencies obtained through professional education. RI Minister of National Education Regulation No. 16 of 2007 concerning Teacher Qualification and Competency Standards. Article 1 paragraph 1 states that every teacher is obliged to meet the academic qualification and teacher competency standards that apply nationally.

Teacher competencies listed in the attachment consist of pedagogical competencies including mastering the characteristics of students from physical, moral, spiritual, social, cultural, emotional and intellectual aspects; master learning theory and the principles of educating learners; develop a curriculum related to the subjects taught; organizing educational learning; utilize information and communication technology for learning purposes; facilitate the development of students' potential to actualize their various potentials; communicate effectively, empathetically and politely with students; carry out assessments and evaluations of learning processes and outcomes; utilize the results of assessments and evaluations for learning purposes; carry out reflective actions to improve the quality of learning (Akbar, 2021) [4].

Personality competency includes acting in accordance with Indonesian religious, legal, social and national cultural norms; present oneself as a person who is honest, has noble character, and is a role model for students and society; present oneself as a steady, stable, mature, wise and authoritative person; demonstrate work ethic, high responsibility, pride in being a teacher, and self-confidence; upholding the teacher professional code of ethics (Huda, 2017) [5].

Social competence includes being inclusive, and acting objectively and not discriminating due to considerations of gender, religion, race, physical condition, family background and socio-economic status; communicate effectively; empathetic and polite with fellow educators, education staff, parents and the community; adapt to places of duty throughout Indonesia which have socio-cultural diversity; communicating with one's own professional community and other professions verbally and in writing or other forms (Muspiroh, 2016) [6].

Professional competence includes mastering the material, structure, concepts and scientific mindset that supports the subject being taught; master the basic competency standards of the subjects taught; develop learning materials taught creatively; develop professionalism continuously by carrying out reflective actions; utilize information and communication technology to develop oneself (Sulastris et al., 2020) [7].

The government reaffirmed its policy regarding teacher competency in December 2008 by issuing a policy regarding teachers contained in Government Regulation Number 74 of 2008 in article

3 stating that competency is a set of knowledge, skills and behavior that must be possessed, internalized, mastered and actualized by teachers in carrying out professional duties which include pedagogical competence, personality competence, social competence and professional competence obtained through professional education (Darmawan, 2020) [8].

This competency is holistic, which means that this competency is integrated and manifested in teacher performance. These four competencies, namely Pedagogical Competency, Personality Competency, Social Competency and Professional Competency are then explained in paragraphs in article 3. In paragraph 4, Pedagogical Competency is the teacher's ability to manage student learning which at least includes a) understanding insight or foundation. education; b) understanding of students; c) development of curriculum or syllabus; d) learning design; e) implementation of endemic and dialogical learning; f) use of learning technology; g) evaluation of learning outcomes; and h) development of students to actualize the various potentials they have. Paragraph 5 Personal Competency includes a personality that a) has faith and piety; b) have noble character; c) wise and wise; d) democratic; e) steady; f) authoritative; g) stable; h) adult; i) honest; j) sportsmanship; k) be a role model for students and society; l) objectively evaluate one's own performance; and m) develop oneself independently and sustainably. Paragraph 6 states that Social Competence is the teacher's ability as part of society which at least includes the competency to: a) communicate verbally, write and/or sign politely; b) use communication and information technology functionally; c) interact effectively with students, fellow educators, education staff, educational unit leaders, parents or guardians of students; d) implementing the principles of true brotherhood and a spirit of togetherness. Paragraph 7 states that Professional Competency is a teacher's ability to master knowledge in the fields of science, technology and/or arts and culture being taught which at least includes mastery of: a) subject matter broadly and in depth in accordance with the standard content of educational unit programs, subjects, and /or group of subjects to be taught; and b) concepts and methods of relevant scientific, technological or artistic disciplines, which conceptually cover or are coherent with the educational unit program, subject and/or group of subjects to be taught.

Based on the mandate above, teachers who are certified educators should display professional and competent teacher character in carrying out their duties and responsibilities professionally. Muh. Anwar H.M (2015:1) in Sopandi (2019) states "teacher competence itself is a teacher's ability to carry out obligations responsibly in the eyes of stakeholders"[9]. With these abilities, teachers can carry out their role as facilitators who provide convenience for students in the teaching and learning process; as a guide who helps students overcome difficulties in the teaching process; as an environmental provider, who strives to create a challenging learning environment for students so that they carry out learning activities enthusiastically; as a model, who is able to provide a good example for students to behave in accordance with existing and applicable norms in the world of education; as a motivator, who helps spread reform efforts to society, especially to educational subjects, namely students; as an agent of cognitive development, which disseminates science and technology to students and society; as a manager, who leads groups of students in class so that the success of the teaching and learning process is achieved.

By having an educator certificate, there are several expectations carried out by professional teachers which are in accordance with the objectives of the certification itself, namely (1) determining the suitability of teachers in carrying out their duties as professional educators, (2) improving learning processes and outcomes, (3) improving welfare teachers, (4) increasing the dignity of teachers, in order to realize quality national education (Usiono, 2021) [10].

However, in reality professional teachers have not carried out their duties properly in accordance with competency demands. There are still teachers who miss work because they do side jobs to meet their family's living needs. It is these side jobs that sometimes make teachers not one hundred percent carry out their duties and responsibilities as teachers and educators. There are teachers who do side jobs such as motorbike taxi drivers, online business owners, livestock breeders and others while carrying out teaching duties. Based on pedagogical competence, teachers should be able to utilize information and communication technology for learning purposes, but in reality there are teachers who have not been

able to utilize existing technology, so that the learning carried out is still focused on old methods such as lectures and becomes an uninteresting learning experience for students. . There are teachers who are unable to keep up with changes and developments in education which can make it difficult for some teachers to follow the latest trends and innovations. They may not always update their knowledge and skills according to student needs and evolving curricula. This can impact their ability to manage the classroom, design and deliver engaging lessons, and provide effective feedback to students. News from the North Sulawesi Tribune on Friday, 17 May 2019 <https://manado.tribunnews.com/2019/05/17/besar-un-smasmk-sulut-di-deretan-terbesar-nasional-ini-kata-gubernur-dan-> The Head of Education said that the results of the National High School/Vocational High School Examination in North Sulawesi were at the bottom nationally. SMA is ranked 32nd and SMK is ranked 31st out of 34 provinces. This illustrates that teachers who have been certified do not have sufficient competence in actualizing their knowledge to students.

The author encountered this phenomenon when making initial observations at SMAN 1 Tondano in Minahasa district. The initial aim of teacher certification is to improve the quality of teachers in Indonesia with the hope of contributing to the increase in the quality of education nationally, the impact of which can provide and improve the quality of teaching and learning for students so they can excel, but reflecting on the problems, students should be getting better, but on the contrary, which is proven by one of the achievements made by SMA Negeri 1 Tondano which only focuses on arts and sports and not holistically which also includes academics, which from the data that the author managed to access on the Official Website https://akupintar.id/school/-/cari-school/detail_school/sman-1-tondano/83395816 (Accessed on 20 May 2023), there are achievements given by students which are only in sports achievements but very lacking in academic achievements. In fact, the last achievement achieved was for the national level in 2018.

Based on the above National Examination score achievement data in the Science and Social Sciences Department, the score achieved according to the standard UN score is 5.5, only for the Indonesian language subject, namely 63.98. Other subjects are still below the specified standards.

At SMA Negeri 1 Tondano the total number of teachers is 60 people with data on the number of Civil Servant (PNS) teachers being 40 people. There are 6 Government Employee Teachers with Contract Agreements (PPPK). There are 9 freelance daily staff (THL) teachers. There are 5 Honorary Teachers. The total number of teachers at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano is 60 people. There are 36 teachers who have been declared professional teachers and have teaching certificates. Student data totaled 855 students, divided into 437 female students and 418 male students. Then, of the number of teachers that the author has explained above, the majority of teachers, namely 60%, have been certified or have received certificates as professional teachers.

Even though many teachers at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano have obtained teacher certification, there are still several problems that can occur in terms of their professionalism and competence as mandated by regulations and policies that explain how a teacher is certified in their actions as an educator/teacher. The competencies possessed by a teacher should be as stated in Government Regulation no. 74 of 2008 concerning teachers article 3.

Therefore, based on the presentation and description of the problems described above, the author is interested in studying this problem further by writing it under the title Implementation of Teacher Certification Policy at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano, Minahasa Regency.

B. Method

This research uses qualitative research, which is basically qualitative research whose objects are natural or natural settings, not artificial or in accordance with facts in the field. Natural objects are objects that are as they are, not manipulated by researchers. In qualitative research, the instrument or research tool is the researcher himself, therefore the researcher as an instrument must also be validated to what extent the qualitative researcher is ready to carry out further research. Qualitative research is research that is used to reveal problems in the work life of government, private, community, youth, women's,

sports, arts and culture organizations, etc. so that it can be used as a policy to be implemented for the sake of mutual prosperity (Sugiyono in Supit & Lumingkewas, 2023) [11].

The main focus of this research is Government Regulation No. 74 of 2008 concerning Teachers, so this research is more focused on Article 3 (three) concerning Teacher Competency at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano, Minahasa Regency. The data analysis technique used is the Miles & Huberman approach model in Sendouw et al. (2023), namely data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions [12]. Then, to ensure the validity of the data, researchers used the 4 main criteria presented by Lincoln and Guba in . (2020), namely credibility, dependability, transferability, and confirmability (Dilapanga et al., 2023) [13].

C. Result and discussion

Implementation of Teacher Certification Policy at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano, Minahasa Regency

According to Langkai (2020:42) "In principle, policy implementation is a way for a policy to achieve its objectives. Not better and not less. To implement public policy, there are two different options, namely implementing it directly with programs or through instructions for action, delegation of authority, distribution of authority and so on." Implementing policies through instructions involves the use of official instructions, regulations or decisions that provide guidance or mandates to the various parties involved in implementing the policy [14]. The implementation of the policy is not only limited to its real implementation but is also related to the consequences or impacts that will appear in the implementation of the policy.

Law Number 14 of 2005 concerning Teachers and Lecturers states that teachers are professional educators with the main task of educating, teaching, guiding, directing, training, assessing and evaluating students in early childhood education, formal education, basic education and education. intermediate. Professional teachers must have a minimum academic qualification of bachelor's degree (S-I) or fourth diploma (D-IV), mastering competencies (pedagogical, professional, social and personality), having the ability to realize national education goals.

Teacher certification is the process of granting certificates to teachers who have met the requirements and is carried out by certification institutions to realize national education goals, increasing teacher competency accompanied by increasing adequate welfare.

Government Regulation No. 74 of 2008 concerning Teachers in Chapter II Competency and certification explains that teachers must have academic qualifications, competency, an educator certificate, be physically and spiritually healthy, and have the ability to realize national education goals. In Articles four - seven it is explained that Teacher Competence is assessed in 4 parts: Pedagogical Competency, Personality Competency, Social Competency and Professional Competence.

Pedagogical Competence

Pedagogical competency is a skill or ability that a teacher must master in looking at students' characteristics from various aspects of life, be it moral, emotional or intellectual (Rahayuningsih & Muhtar, 2022)[15]. This understanding includes 1) understanding the insight or foundation of education. 2) understanding of students. 3) development of curriculum or syllabus. 4) learning design. 5) implementation of educational and dialogical learning. 6) use of learning technology. 7) evaluation of learning outcomes. 8) development of students to actualize the various potentials they have.

In the context of SMA Negeri 1 Tondano, research was carried out by conducting interviews to obtain data related to how to implement pedagogical competencies for certified teachers. Based on the results of research conducted by researchers on informants regarding pedagogical competence, this research shows that it turns out that teachers already know the basic rules regarding professional educators, even though a forum for developing their abilities has been provided, there are still very few teachers who want to improve their abilities. Then, teachers still don't understand the characteristics of their students because they focus on students who excel and students who have problems. Students with an ability level that can be said to be at the intermediate level are not given much attention. In terms of curriculum development, even though school leaders have formed a curriculum development team, the

implementation of development is hampered by individual teachers themselves, as well as facilities and infrastructure that are less supportive.

As a professional teacher who has received a certification allowance, teachers are obliged to design their own learning tools. However, in reality the majority of senior teachers are unable to design their own learning tools due to their lack of ICT mastery. Professional teachers must also be able to provide teaching that is educational, dialogical and challenges children to think critically, but in implementation in the field, not all teachers at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano are able to provide this learning. The implementation of learning by teachers who master ICT is limited to discussion methods, a combination of lectures and demonstrations and the use of videos as learning aids.

The lack of mastery of ICT by senior teachers, as well as inadequate ICT infrastructure, means that students' enthusiasm for learning and understanding the material decreases, thereby reducing positive responses that ensure students understand the material provided. Learning evaluation must be carried out by teachers through assignments and various forms of tests. The results of the evaluation must then be followed up in the form of providing assistance, guidance and remedial measures. The strategy for developing student potential (interests and talents) is carried out through extracurricular activities. These activities will further direct and guide students and motivate students to develop their interests and talents.

Personality Competencies

Personality competency refers to how a teacher acts in accordance with religious norms, legal norms, social norms and Indonesian national culture (Nuryovi et al., 2018) [16]. The personality competency as referred to at least includes a personality who: 1) has faith and piety; 2) have noble character; 3) wise and wise; 4) democratic; 5) steady; 6) authoritative; 7) stable; 8) adult; 9) honest; 10) sportsmanship; 11) be a role model for students and society; 12) objectively evaluate one's own performance; 13) develop yourself independently and sustainably.

Based on the results of the interviews, it was found that teachers showed a personality of faith and devotion to God through their activeness in spiritual service, and this influenced the teachers' daily morals or behavior. Teachers at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano have behaved wisely and wisely as well as democratically because they are able to treat students and co-workers equally, without favoritism, respecting and respecting each other. The regrettable thing is that the teachers at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano have not been able to be role models for their students because of the lack of discipline from the teachers, which ultimately made the teachers lose their authority. Teacher indiscipline also ultimately means teachers are unable to evaluate their self-performance objectively.

Continuous development of personal competence is the responsibility of each teacher. Senior teachers who are about to retire no longer have the desire to develop their own competence, even though various programs and activities for developing self-competence are available, for example through training, workshops and teacher mobilization programs.

Social Competence

Social competence is the teacher's ability as part of society which at least includes the competence to 1) communicate verbally, in writing and/or in a polite manner; 2) use communication and information technology functionally; 3) interact effectively with students, fellow educators, education staff, educational unit leaders, parents or guardians of students; 4) interact politely with the surrounding community by paying attention to applicable norms and value systems; 5) apply the principles of true brotherhood and a spirit of togetherness (Mazrur et al., 2022) [17].

Research findings show that the social competence of SMA Negeri 1 Tondano teachers is still problematic. Teachers who should be role models in interacting and communicating have not been able to implement good communication practices, even though they establish good relationships between all elements of the school. Communication that is not polite indicates that the teacher does not have the ability and skills to interact and communicate. Nevertheless, a positive educational environment has

been created in SMA Negeri 1 Tondano because all elements behave well, avoid problems, respect and appreciate each other, and help each other.

The use of ICT will also really help teachers in communicating with students in teaching and learning activities. However, not all teachers are able to use it, especially senior teachers. The use of ICT is also limited to the use of LCDs, cellphones and laptops.

Professional Competency

Professional competence is the teacher's ability to master knowledge in the fields of science, technology, and/or arts and culture that he/she is responsible for, which at least includes mastery of: 1) broad and in-depth subject matter in accordance with educational unit program content standards, subjects, and/ or group of subjects to be taught; 2) concepts and methods of relevant scientific, technological or artistic disciplines, which conceptually cover or are coherent with the educational unit program, subject and/or group of subjects to be taught (Ilyas, 2022) [18].

In the context of SMA Negeri 1 Tondano, research was carried out by conducting interviews to obtain data related to how to implement professional competencies for certified teachers. Based on the results of research conducted by researchers on informants regarding professional competence, this research shows that it turns out that professional teachers who have an educator certificate do not necessarily guarantee that the teacher has the skills, abilities, knowledge and skills to improve the quality of the teaching and learning process. Another thing that was found was that substitute subject teachers did not master the lesson material because it did not suit the field of knowledge of the teacher concerned, even though the subject teacher should have had a suitable educational background. Professionalism is also not reflected in the teachers of SMA Negeri 1 Tondano, because the teachers still lack discipline, both in terms of working hours and dress discipline. Monitoring of the learning process has been carried out by the school and related agencies, but violations are still found by teachers. The implementation of coaching sanctions and reducing teaching hours apparently did not deter teachers.

D. Conclusion

Based on the findings and discussion in this research regarding the pedagogical, personality, social and professional competencies of certified teachers at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano, Minahasa Regency, the following conclusions can be drawn:

Pedagogical Competency: Teachers who understand the basic rules regarding professional education do not fully utilize the capacity development platforms that have been provided. To understand students, teachers still have a tendency to focus on certain students, for example students who excel and students who have problems. Meanwhile, students who have moderate or intermediate abilities are often ignored. To create an attractive teaching and learning process, certified senior teachers need to improve their ability to use technological tools and mastery of ICT in accordance with existing technological developments and advances, as well as the availability of technology-based facilities or infrastructure needs to be improved.

Personality Competence: There are some professionally certified teachers at SMA Negeri 1 Tondano who have not been able to be role models for their students because of the lack of discipline on the part of the teachers, which ultimately makes the teachers lose their authority. Teacher indiscipline also ultimately means teachers are unable to evaluate their self-performance objectively.

Social Competence: Teachers who should be role models in interacting and communicating have not been able to implement good communication practices, even though they establish good relationships between all elements of the school. Communication that is not polite indicates that the teacher does not have the ability and skills to interact and communicate. Nevertheless, a positive educational environment has been created in SMA Negeri 1 Tondano because all elements behave well, avoid problems, respect and appreciate each other, and help each other.

Professional Competence: Professionalism has not been reflected in the teachers of SMA Negeri 1 Tondano, because the teachers still lack discipline, both in terms of working hours and dress discipline. Monitoring of the learning process has been carried out by the school and related agencies, but violations

are still found by teachers. The implementation of coaching sanctions and reducing teaching hours apparently did not deter teachers.

References

- [1] T. Noor, "rumusan tujuan pendidikan nasional pasal 3 undang-undang sistem pendidikan nasional No 20 Tahun 2003," *Wahana Karya Ilm. Pendidik.*, vol. 2, no. 01, 2018.
- [2] M. Chatib, *Sekolahnya manusia: sekolah berbasis multiple intelligences di Indonesia*. Kaifa, 2009.
- [3] E. E. Masengi, E. Lumingkewas, and B. F. Supit, "Implementasi Kebijakan Sertifikasi Guru Dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Guru Di SMA Negeri 2 Tondano," *Acad. Educ. J.*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 1084–1095, 2023, [Online]. Available: <https://www.atlantispress.com/proceedings/unicssh-22/125984016>
- [4] Akbar, "Pentingnya kompetensi pedagogik guru," *JPG J. Pendidik. Guru*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 23–30, 2021.
- [5] M. Huda, "Kompetensi kepribadian guru dan motivasi belajar siswa," *J. Penelit.*, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 237–266, 2017.
- [6] N. Muspiroh, "Peran kompetensi sosial guru dalam menciptakan efektifitas pembelajaran," *Edueksos J. Pendidik. Sos. Ekon.*, vol. 4, no. 2, 2016.
- [7] S. Sulastri, H. Fitria, and A. Martha, "Kompetensi profesional guru dalam meningkatkan mutu pendidikan," *J. Educ. Res.*, vol. 1, no. 3, pp. 258–264, 2020.
- [8] C. Darmawan, "Implementasi Kebijakan Profesi Guru Menurut Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 14 Tahun 2005 Tentang Guru dan Dosen Dalam Perspektif Hukum Pendidikan," *Wacana Paramarta J. Ilmu Huk.*, vol. 19, no. 2, pp. 61–68, 2020.
- [9] Sopandi, "Pengaruh kompetensi profesional dan kompetensi kepribadian terhadap kinerja guru," *Sci. J. Reflect. Econ. Accounting, Manag. Bus.*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 121–130, 2019.
- [10] R. W. Usiono, "Evaluasi Peningkatan Mutu Sekolah Melalui Pengembangan Profesionalisme Guru," *Cybern. J. Educ. Res. Soc. Stud.*, pp. 55–65, 2021.
- [11] B. F. Supit and E. Lumingkewas, "Implementasi Kebijakan Bantuan Sosial Tunai Di Kelurahan Talikuran Utara Kecamatan Kawangkoan Utara Minahasa," *Acad. Educ. J.*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 1059–1068, 2023, doi: <https://doi.org/10.47200/aoej.v14i2.1981>.
- [12] R. H. E. Sendouw, E. M. C. Lumingkewas, B. F. Supit, and P. M. M. Kapojos, "Analysis of Performance Appraisal of State Civil Apparatus in the Regional Office of Education of North Sulawesi Province," *Tech. Soc. Sci. J.*, vol. 49, pp. 90–96, 2023.
- [13] R. Dilapanga, B. F. Supit, and A. K. V Mandagi, "The Role of Community Participation in Supporting Tomohon City Regional Regulation No. 1 of 2021," in *Iapa Proceedings Conference, 2023*, pp. 36–46.
- [14] J. E. Langkai, *Kebijakan Publik*. Malang: Seribu Bintang, 2020.
- [15] Y. S. Rahayuningsih and T. Muhtar, "Pedagogik Digital Sebagai Upaya untuk Meningkatkan Kompetensi Guru Abad 21," *J. Basicedu*, vol. 6, no. 4, pp. 6960–6966, 2022.
- [16] N. Nuryovi, O. Wiharna, and S. Sriyono, "Persepsi Siswa Tentang Kompetensi Pedagogik dan Kompetensi Kepribadian Guru," *J. Mech. Eng. Educ.*, vol. 4, no. 2, pp. 219–224, 2018.
- [17] M. Mazrur, S. Surawan, and Y. Yuliani, "Kontribusi Kompetensi Sosial Guru dalam Membentuk Karakter Siswa," *Attract. Innov. Educ. J.*, vol. 4, no. 2, pp. 281–287, 2022.
- [18] Ilyas, "Strategi Peningkatan Kompetensi Profesional Guru," *J. Inovasi, Eval. Dan Pengemb. Pembelajaran*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 34–40, 2022.