



TECHNIUM
SOCIAL SCIENCES JOURNAL

Vol. 12, 2020

**A new decade
for social changes**

www.techniumscience.com

ISSN 2668-7798



9 772668 779000

Evaluation of program of community learning activities center (PKBM) in Batam City Province of Riau Islands

Mohammad Chaidir¹, Suryadi², Madha Komala³

Education management, postgraduate, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia

chaidirismail@yahoo.co.id

Abstract. The purpose of this study was to conduct an evaluation of the community learning activity center program, the background of the holding of this training program was to achieve equitable education, the legal foundation provided in this study was based on the regulation from the Riau Islands province, and the strategy of implementing the community learning center program (PKBM) was carried out in Batam, the research method used in this study was qualitative, there were five schools used as research subjects. The evaluation carried out at the design stage is related to the policy of implementing community learning program programs in Riau Islands Province. The draft policy must be in place and finalized before the policy is implemented. Policy design is very necessary before a policy is implemented because it will provide clearer direction in setting the steps that must be taken when implementing the policy. Aspects related to the policy design of the implementation of community learning programs include the legal basis, objectives and strategies. Based on the evaluation of the design of the central policy of community learning activities can be said to have been good because there are clear objectives, legal foundation and institutional functions, the implementation of the package equality education program is based on the needs of the community, the existence of a clear package equality program and the existence of clear and good program achievement indicators.

Keywords. Evaluation, implementation, center for learning activities of Masyarakat

Introduction:

National education as mandated in Law No. 20 of 2003, known in three lines i.e. informal education pathways, formal education pathways and nonformal education pathways, where between these lines complement each other in developing human resources. Non-formal education as stated in article 26 paragraph 4, is described that a non-formal education unit consists of course institutions, training institutes, study groups, public learning activities centers, taklim assemblies and similar education units. The rapidly growing non-formal education unit is the center for Community Learning Activities (PKBM), which at the beginning of its inception was established at the sub-district level then spread to each village or Kalurahan. This community education is not a PKBM with a diploma or certificate facility that is in priority, but the benchmark is how many people who need that knowledge can absorb the science and also use it for their benefit. Seeking the ability of appropriate technology that is easily absorbed by the community, so those who do not know to know, who know to be

proficient, who are proficient to become experts and alongside PKBM increase public knowledge about that knowledge.

Many programs of learning activities organized by PKBM depend on the needs of the surrounding community. In general, it can be grouped in three areas, namely learning activities, the field of productive economic business (business activities) and community development activities. Field of learning, is the activity of a group learning process that seeks to transform the ability of intellectual, emotional and spiritual, character and personality (aspects of cognition, affection and psychomotor). Learning covers all circles from an early age until the elderly either male or female. The field of productive economy, is an activity related to increasing member economic empowerment, including business unit programs PKBM, Business Study Group, community Business Development, community business cooperation, increase in community productivity, new job creation and others. While the field of community development, is the strengthening of group capacity activities that include strengthening of facilities/infrastructure/physical infrastructure, improvement and development of the environment, development.

The Center for Community Learning Activities (PKBM) is a Community learning initiative established from, by and for the community. PKBM is a community based Institution. The terminology of PKBM of the community, means that the establishment of PKBM is an initiative of the community itself. By the community, it means that the implementation, development, and sustainability of the PKBM is entirely the responsibility of the community itself. For the community, it means that the existence of PKBM is entirely for the advancement and the empowerment of people's lives where the institution is located. The programs held in PKBM vary greatly in accordance with the conditions and needs of the community in which the PKBM is located. But in general, among others: (1) Equality Education: Package A, Package B and PaketC. (2) Early Childhood Education (PAUD). (3) Functional literacy (for blind characters). (4) Community reading Garden (TBM). (5) Skill education and life skills. (6) Citizenship education and homemaking. (7) Mental and Spiritual education or religion. (8) Entrepreneurship Education and Business Study Group earning (KBU). (9) Arts and cultural education, etc.

The focus of research is the implementation of Community Learning Activities Center Program (PKBM) in Batam City, Riau Islands province; With sub-focus research as follows:

1. The background of the training programs, objectives to be achieved, the legal basis provided, and the strategy of implementing the Center program of Community Learning Activities (PKBM) in the city of Batam.
2. The readiness of targeted learners, qualifications and quantity of Widyaiswara and required staff, education curriculum, learning materials, facilities, infrastructure and budget are provided as well as a schedule plan implementation of Community Learning Activities Center (PKBM) in Batam.
3. The process of implementing PKBM program, strategy and utilization of educator resources, utilization of facilities, infrastructure and budgets provided, as well as the constraints faced.
4. Results achieved during and after the center program of Public Learning Activities (PKBM) in the city of Batam held.

Study Theory:

The results of the policy in fact have value, this is because the result contributes to the goal or goal, in this case it is said that the policy or program has achieved a meaningful level of performance, which means that the policy issues are made clear or addressed (Dunn, 2013). Meanwhile, Nugroho said that the evaluation will provide valid and trustworthy information

regarding the policy performance of how far, the needs, values and opportunities have been achieved through public action (Nugroho, 2014). According to (Holli & Calabrese, 2008) argues that the evaluation is comparisons of an observed value or quality to a standard or criteria of comparison. It is the process of forming value judgements about the quality of programmes, products and goals. Comparison of the observed values or quality with standard or comparison criteria. It is the process of forming judgments about the quality of programs, products and objectives. Another opinion, (Boulmetis & Dutin, 2010) states that the evaluation is the systematic process of collecting and analyzing data in order to determine whether and to what degree objectives were or are being achieved. The systematic process of collecting and analyzing data to determine whether and how far the objectives have been achieved or are being achieved.

The Center for Community Learning Activities (PKBM) (Kemdikbud, 2017) as a unit of Nonformal education is a learning initiative of, by, and for society. The Center for Community Learning Activities (PKBM) is a Community learning initiative established from, by and for the community. PKBM is a community based Institution. The terminology of PKBM of the community, means that the establishment of PKBM is an initiative of the community itself. That desire comes from an awareness of the importance of improving the quality of life through a transformational and learning process.

Broadly, the product evaluations include the program's operational goal setting, the measuring criteria that have been achieved, comparing it between the field reality and the formulation of objectives, and drafting a rational interpretation (Arikunto, 2018). Stufflebeam (Stufflebeam, 2007) defines THE evaluation as The process of delineating, obtaining, and providing useful information for judging decisions alternatives. The process illustrates, acquires, and provides useful information for alternative consideration of decisions. There are three important points in that definition. First, evaluation is understood as a continuous systematic process. Secondly, the evaluation process includes three basic steps: the boundary of questions to be answered and the information to be acquired, obtaining relevant information, and providing information to the decision-makers so that they can use it to make decisions and thereby be able to improve the ongoing program. Thirdly, evaluation is understood as a process to serve decision making.

Method:

The research site is in PKBM Batam city. The study was conducted for six (6) months, starting from September 2015 until February 2016. Beginning with preliminary research, proposal drafting and proposal seminar conducted in January 2016. In January 2016 was conducted research instrument preparation. The test of the research instrument was conducted in January 2016. Penjarangan and data analysis took place from February 2016.

The research approach used in this study is the phenomenological approach. Phenomenology seeks to uncover and learn and understand a phenomenon along with the distinctive and unique context experienced by the individual to the individual's "conviction" level. Thus in learning and understanding, it must be based on the viewpoint, paradigm and direct belief of the individual concerned as the subject of direct experience (Herdiansyah, 2018). This research uses the evaluation approach of implementing educational programs.

This research includes a type of qualitative research. Qualitative research method is a method of research based on the philosophy of postpositivism, used for researchers on natural object conditions, where the researcher is as a key instrument (Sugiyono, 2018). Another sense of mention that qualitative research is a type of research that Temuan-temuannya not obtained through statistical procedures or other forms of calculation (Strauss & Corbin, 2019). Creswell

states that qualitative research is a process of scientific research that is more intended to understand human problems in the social context by creating a thorough and complex picture presented, reporting a detailed view of the sources of information, and done in a natural setting without any intervention from researchers.

According to (Sudjana & Ibrahim, 2014) translates each of these dimensions with the following meanings:

1. Context; Situation or background that affects the types of objectives and educational strategies that will be developed in the system concerned, such as the perceived educational problems, state economic situation, the views of the community life and so forth.
2. Input; means/capital/material and strategy plan applied to achieve educational objectives.
3. Process; Implementation of the strategy and use of means/capital/material in the real activity in the field
4. Product; Results achieved either during or at the end of the development of the education system concerned.



Figure 1 Design evaluation of CIPP Model

A grid of research instruments as a guideline in the implementation of research that includes observation activities, interviews, and documentation studies required during the study are as follows:

Table 1. Lattice Research Instruments

Components evaluated	Indicators	Standard	Instruments	Data source
Context	Clear analysis and the design of clear inputs, processes, and outputs related to PKBM program	Legal bases and regulations for implementing PKBM	Interview and observation of documents	Department of Education and Culture Batam
Input	The availability of resources, devices and equipment to support the implementation of the PKBM program.	Rules and design of education programs	Interview and observation of documents	Head of PKBM-PKBM in Batam city
Process	The operation of the PKBM program in accordance with the planned.	Rules and design of education programs	Interview and observation of documents	Head of PKBM-PKBM in Batam city

Products	Achievement of objectives in accordance with the design or draft program PKBM	Rules and design of education programs	Interview and observation of documents	Department of Education and Culture, head of PKBM-PKBM, and alumni of learners in the city of Batam
----------	---	--	--	---

The data collection techniques used in this study were observations, interviews, documentation studies. In the Evaluation research policy implementation, data analysis was conducted since the beginning of research and during the research process was implemented. Data is obtained, then collected to be processed systematically. Starting from interviews, observations, editing, classifying, reducing, subsequent activity presenting data as well as concluding data.

Results and discussion:

Evaluation of the program of Community Learning Activities Center (PKBM) in the city of Batam province of Riau Islands consisting of 4 stages.

Evaluation conducted at the design level related to the policy of organizing activities program in Riau Islands province. The policy draft must exist and be matted before the policy is implemented. Policy design is indispensable before a policy is implemented as it will provide a clearer direction in establishing the steps to be taken when implementing the policy. Aspects related to the design of the policy of organizing programs of learning activities include legal basis, objectives, and strategies.

Evaluation of the Center for the preparation of community learning activities that started from the students in the province of Riau Islands consisting of residents studying, trainees, counseling participants, trainees, students, and so on. These learners have internal characteristics, namely physical attributes, psychic and functional attributes. Physical attributes of age, gender, five-senses condition, etc. Psychic attributes include learning readiness, motivation, mental abilities, and cognition structures. Functional attributes include the work, education, health and socio-economic status of the family. Students of Education program Equality package in the Riau Islands Province is a citizen, especially the area of Batam City and surrounding areas who want to participate in the Education program equality package. The number of student groups studying package A, B and C as a whole amounted to 130 people, but in the process of learning can not be active all. The student recruitment system is done by socializing the program equality education programme through community leaders in Batam City and surrounding districts. In student recruitment there are no special qualifications that important learners follow in learning on the package program. For citizens who are interested immediately register to the organizer of PKBM Seroja for example. After signing up then learners are gathered and conducting a study contract especially time and place of learning. The students hope after joining the package equality program in order to add knowledge.

Evaluate the policy implementation process. At the process stage, the component being evaluated is the implementation or implementation of the PKBM implementation policy in Riau Islands Province. The implementation of the policy is the implementation of the plans that have been made previously. Aspects of implementing the policy mainly concern resource management, cooperative relations, application of curriculum relevance, evaluation, monitoring as well as constraints and supporting factors. The process of implementing a training program: Evaluating the PKBM implementation process in Riau Islands Province has a function

as controlling the process and results of the training program so that a training program that is systematic, effective and efficient can be guaranteed. Training evaluation is a process for collecting data and information needed in a training program. Training evaluation is more focused on reviewing the training process and evaluating the results of training and the impact of training related to HR performance. Evaluation of the process of implementing the PKBM process is a very important part of the training program, considering that it has spent a lot of time, energy, and costs for its implementation. So that training is not in vain, an evaluation and follow-up step is carried out regularly. Evaluation of a training program is needed to find out how far the increase in knowledge, skills and attitudes of staff occurs and how much its application in giving meaning or influence to themselves, their groups and organizations. , strategies and utilization of educator resources, utilization of facilities, infrastructure and budget provided, and the constraints faced. There are three steps in evaluating the implementation of PKBM carried out in Riau Islands Province, namely by using evaluation instruments and the design depends on what evaluation steps will be carried out.

Evaluation of product achievement, the quality of the results of the Education Program Equality Package education Program is as a non-formal implementing institution that is under the auspices of the informal Education Office of Riau Islands province which aims to equip knowledge and skills to the community, and provide learning opportunities to the community. In addition, the program equality plan also aims to explore, cultivate, develop, utilize all the potential in the community, to the greatest empowerment of the community itself, and the development of knowledge and skills to suit the needs and desires of society. Results of equality program This package is generally expressed by the mother "TM" as a package tutor, he said that: "The results of the education program equality package can be said to be in accordance with the intended purpose. Learners can apply the knowledge and skills they acquire. These results can be seen from the results of our evaluation to the students and the results can be observed that all learners who follow the process of activity completely in accordance with the procedure or order implementation of the package and have followed the overall evaluation of the stated good value Pass ".

Mr. "JA" who is also a package tutor, he said that: "Overall learners can develop and utilize all the potential in the community. Learners also experience a change of attitude in following the process of package activities including students increasingly disciplined, confident, can cooperate with other friends and improved behavior better ".

It is also delivered by Mr. "MGH" as the chairman of PKBM who said that: "Learners experience improvement after following the study of package B pack, it is proven they can apply the knowledge and skills they acquire in everyday life."

From some of the above statements can be concluded that the outcome of the Education program Equality package is in accordance with the intended purpose. Learners can apply the knowledge they acquire in their daily lives. The result of an interview Data on the outcome of the program's equality education programme is generally delivered by a tutor who says that results of the student package program in an outline can apply the knowledge they acquire in their daily lives. Learners also understand all material delivered by tutors. These results can be seen from the results of the evaluation that has been done to the students and the results can be observed that all learners who follow the process of activity completely in accordance with the procedure or order implementation of the package and have followed the overall evaluation can be said students are declared to pass with good grades. In addition, the student process also experienced a change of attitude in following the process of package among students increasingly disciplined, confident, can cooperate with other friends and increased behavior better.

See the above research results can be concluded. Education program equality package seen in terms of quality results of the program equality of the package can be said to be in accordance with the intended purpose. Number and percentage of learners' graduation. The number of students who participated in the package of equality in PKBM Ngudi Makmur was a total of 130 people. Through observation and research documentation is a list of graduation values can be said all learners graduated following the package and stated to pass 100%, then the percentage of graduation is 100%. This was conveyed by Mr. JA, as the package tutor, he said that: "Students of Education program Equality package B stated that graduation means a percentage of 100% graduation". Mrs. MH as a student the package also said that: "Alhamdulillah sir, we are all declared to pass all the pack, we are very pleased to pack." The same statement is also narrated by Mr. SG, as chairman of PKBM, stating that: "The learners of package B stated this pass all the pack, with satisfactory value."

From some of the above statements can be concluded that all learners who follow the education program equality package is declared to pass all. The number of students who participated in the education program of equality package in PKBM in Riau Islands province is 130 people. All learners graduate following the package program. See the data on the results of the above research can be concluded that, education program equality package in PKBM Riau Islands province is seen in terms of quality of the program results can be said to be good. This is evidenced by the improvement of quality that has been obtained by students of education program equality package. In addition, the percentage of student graduation is 100% and already in accordance with the indicators of the achievement of education Program equality package in PKBM Riau Islands province Makmur.

Discussion:

Organizing function as a dynamic organization. Historically, organizing includes creating an organizational chart by identifying business functions, establishing relationship reporting, and having personnel departments that take care of plans, programs and work papers. In PKBM Seroja has held its learning schedule arrangement namely on Mondays, Tuesdays, Thursdays, Fridays and Saturdays, especially for Wednesdays and Saturdays is a holiday. Based on the organizing standards, PKBM must formulate a learning for the effectiveness of learning. And the process of learning to teach in PKBM is effective despite the constraints in the presence of citizens learn. Here the PKBM Seroja explained that the absence of the citizens learn due to many obstacles such as the citizens of learning who are far from the place where PKBM is located, as well as the citizens who are more concerned about their work than studying, perhaps this is due to economic problems that are not so adequate that it requires them to better prioritize their work rather than learning. As well as for teachers of the PKBM Seroja has tutors from among those who have been profession as civil servants and also honorers.

Types of assessment of learning outcomes conducted by educators, among others: 1) written assessment (Essay test, short stuffing, double choice, true false), 2) assessment through observation or observation, experiments, 3) assessment of independent assignments and/or groups, 4) assessment of the portfolio. In addition to these types of assessments above the educator can also do other types and techniques in accordance with the purpose of his lesson. As explained by (Learning Activities Development Hall, 2001) that activities in the implementation of PKBM are: (1) Motivate citizens to learn, (2) to organize and or develop basic learning materials for citizens studying and basic teaching materials for tutors or resource persons; (3) Implement the teaching and learning process; and (4) assessing the process and results of teaching activities periodically.

Similarly, the implementation of PKBM as a container of human resources development, therefore (Learning activities Development Hall, 2001) Set measures: (1) implementing monitoring and control of the implementation of programs/activities; (2) Measuring the achievement level of the arrangement objectives; (3) Prepare the recommendation of measurement results and input materials of the annual work plan; and (4) Prepare annual report on the implementation of PKBM. From the evaluation of PKBM Seroja is also experiencing problems in the learning community, this can be seen from the findings of the following researchers: in the field of teaching, usually citizens learn often absent at a predetermined schedule ".

Based on the results of interviews and observations, there are obstacles in the field of learning that the citizens of learning are often absent or absent on the learning schedule, according to the head of PKBM Seroja this because the citizens learn that more prioritizing their work than learning. Because of the economic factors that require them to prefer to their work than to be present to study. But the chairman of PKBM Mr. Ralin MS stated that he has been record and follow up on this problem and other problems.

Conclusion:

Based on the results of the study on the evaluation of the learning activities of Masyarakat in Riau Islands province can be withdrawn as follows:

1. based on the evaluation of the policy draft community learning activities can be said to be good because of the purpose, the foundation of the law and the clear function of the institution, the implementation of the package equality education program based on the needs of the community, the existence of a clear package equality program and the presence of clear and good achievement indicators.
2. based on the evaluation of the Center for the preparation of Community learning activities, the education program in the equality package can be said to have a tutor that provides educational materials according to the education, and need a facility of the addition of learning room.
3. based on the evaluation process of the center of public Learning activities of education program equality package can be said is good. Schedule of learning activities and the list of presences exist, methods and models that are used both and appropriately, monitoring and evaluation of learning activities are well underway and have a standard reference of good judgment.
4. based on product evaluation of the achievement of the center of the activity of learning activities (products) on the program of education equality package can be said to be good, evidenced by the increasing quality that has been obtained by the students and the percentage of student graduation is 100%. Already in accordance with the indicator of the achievement of the package equality program by each PKBM referring to the direction of the Education Office of Riau Islands province.

References:

- [1]. Arikunto, S. (2014). *Education Program evaluation*. Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.
- [2]. Arikunto, S. (2018). *Fundamentals of Education evaluation*. Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.
- [3]. Azizi. (2011). The Using of Model Context. Input, Process and Products (CIPP) In Learning Programs Assessment ". *International Conference on Challenges and Prospects in Teacher Education* (p. 16). Jakarta: Ashar Publisier.
- [4]. Boulmetis, & Dutin. (2010). *The ABC " s of Evaluation: Timeless Techniques for program and project managers*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

- [5]. Brinkerhoff. (2007). *Program evaluation practitioners guide for trainers and educator*. Boston: Kluwer Nijhoff Publishing.
- [6]. Dunn, W. (2013). *Analisis Kebijakan Publik*. Batam: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- [7]. Herdiansyah, H. (2018). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif: Untuk Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*. Jakarta: Salemba Humanika.
- [8]. Hiryanto. (2018). *Strategi Pengelolaan dan Pengembangan Pusat Kegiatan Belajar Masyarakat (PKBM)*. Batam: PKBM Sejahtera Sleman.
- [9]. Holli, & Calabrese. (2008). *Communication and education Skills for dietetics professionals*. Philadelphia: Williams & Wilkins.
- [10]. Howlett, & Ramesh. (2013). *Studying public policy. Policy cycles and policy subsystems*. Canada: OUP.
- [11]. Isaac, S., & Michael, W. B. (2015). *Handbook in Reasearch and Evaluation: For Education and the Behavioral Sciences*. San Diego: CA:Edits.
- [12]. Kemdikbud. (2017, 09 08). Direktorat Pembinaan Pendidikan Masyarakat Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini Nonformal dan Informal, Standar dan Prosedur Penyelenggaraan Pusat Kegiatan Belajar Masyarakat (PKBM). 2017, Jakarta.
- [13]. Kemdikbud. (2019, 02 02). *Bina Pendidikan Masyarakat*. Retrieved from Kemdikbud: <http://bindikmas.kemdikbud.go.id/nilem/>
- [14]. King, J. (2018, 08 09). An Evaluation of a Character Education Program at an Elementary School. Nova Southeastern University.
- [15]. Miles, M., & Huberman, M. (2012). *Analisis data Kualitatif : Buku Sumber tentang Metode-Metode Baru*. Jakarta: UI Press.
- [16]. Muklir. (2019, Oktober 01). *Evaluasi Kebijakan Publik*. Retrieved from Evaluasi Kebijakan: <http://kebijakanpublik.com>
- [17]. Mustopadidjaya. (2015). *Manajemen Proses Kebijakan Publik*. Jakarta: Duta Pertiwi Foundation.
- [18]. Noe. (2018). *Employees Training and Development*. US: Mc-Graw Hill.
- [19]. Nugroho, R. (2014). *Kebijakan Publik Formulasi, Implementasi, dan Evaluasi*. Jakarta: PT. Elex Media Komputindo.
- [20]. Nugroho, R. (2019). *Public Policy, Edisi Revisi*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- [21]. Parmadi, Dantes, & Marhaeni. (2018). Studi Evaluasi tentang Pelaksanaan Program Pengembangan Diri pada SMP Negeri di Kecamatan Negara". *Journal Program Pascasarjana Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha*, 17.
- [22]. Patton, M. Q. (2017). *Qualitative Education Methods*. Beverly Hills: Sage Publication.
- [23]. Philips. (1991). *Handbook of training evaluation and measurement methods*. Oxford: Butterworth- Heinemann.
- [24]. Pressman, J., & Wildavsky, A. (2004). *Implementation: 3rd edition*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- [25]. Schalock. (2008). *Outcome Based Evaluations*. Boston: Kluwer Academic/Plenum.
- [26]. Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (2019). *Dasar-Dasar Penelitian Kualitatif; Tata Langkah dan Teknik-Teknik Teoritisasi Data*. Batam: Pustaka Pelajar.
- [27]. Stufflebeam. (2007). *The Relevance of the CIPP Evaluation Model for Educational Accountability, Paper presented at the Annual meeting of the American Association of School Administrators*. Atlantic: N.J Atlantic.
- [28]. Stufflebeam, & Shinkfield. (2005). *Systematic Evaluation*. Boston: Kluwer Nijhof Publishing.

- [29]. Suarjana, Dantes, & Natajaya. (2018). “Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Program Pusat Kegiatan Belajar Masyarakat (PKBM) di Kecamatan Gerogkak Kabupaten Buleleng”. *e-Journal Program Pascasarjana Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha*, 14.
- [30]. Sudjana, N., & Ibrahim. (2014). *Penelitian dan Penilaian Pendidikan*. Bandung: Sinar Baru Algesindo.
- [31]. Sugiyono. (2018). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif , Kualitatif, dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- [32]. Toole. (2014). *Rational Choice and Policy Implementation*. Amerika: American Review of Public Administration,.
- [33]. Widodo, J. (2010). *Analisis Kebijakan Publik, Konsep dan Aplikasi Analisis Kebijakan Publik*. Malang: Bayu Media.
- [34]. Winarno, B. (2012). *Kebijakan Publik Teori, Proses, dan Studi Kasus*. Jakarta: Center for Academic Publishing Service.
- [35]. Winarno, B. (2012). *Teori dan Proses Kebijakan Publik*. Batam: Media Pressindo.
- [36]. Zhang. (2016). Using the Context, Input, Process, and Product Evaluation Model (CIPP) as a Comprehensive Framework to Guide the Planning, Implementation, and Assessment of Service-learning Programs. *Journal of Higher Education Outreach and Engagement*, 17.